scola transcript from shelly.txt

1

2

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS 1 2 3 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, 4 5 Plaintiff, Criminal Action No. 04-10135-GA0 6 VS. 7 8 THOMAS SCOLA, ET AL, 9 Defendants. 10 11 TRANSCRIPT OF STATEMENT OF REASONS 12 BEFORE THE HONORABLE GEORGE A. O'TOOLE, JR. 13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE 14 15 United States District Court John J. Moakley U.S. Courthouse 16 1 Courthouse Way Boston, Massachusetts November 15, 2006 17 02210 2:35 p.m. 18 19 20 21 22 SHELLY M. KILLIAN, RPR, CM, CRR Official Court Reporter John J. Moakley U.S. Courthouse 1 Courthouse Way, Room 3510 Boston, MA 02210 (617) 737-7117 23 24 25 APPEARANCES: 1

- 2 For the Plaintiff:
- 3

David G. Tobin United States Attorney's Office

John Joseph Moakley Federal Courthouse 1 Courthouse Way, Suite 9200 4

Page 1

5	Boston, Massachusetts 02210	
6	For Defendant Thomas Scola:	
7	Janice Bassil, Attorney at Law	
Carney & Bassi I 8 20 Park Plaza, Suite 800 Poston Massachusetts 02116		
9	Boston, Massachusetts 02116	
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
		3
1	PROCEEDINGS	
2	(The following proceedings were held in open	
3	court before the Honorable George A. O'Toole, Jr.,	
4	United States District Judge, United States District	
5	Court, District of Massachusetts, at the John J. Moakley	
6	United States Courthouse, 1 Courthouse Way, Boston,	
7	Massachusetts, on November 15, 2006.	
8	Defendant Thomas Scola is present with	
9	counsel. Assistant U.S. Attorney David Tobin is	

scola transcript from shelly. txt 10 present.) 11 THE COURT: We have determined that the 12 guidelines regard Mr. Scola as a career offender and 13 accordingly propose a range of 151 to 188 months on the 14 basis of that. A career offender, as I said, meaning that he has literally met the preconditions to that 15 16 status for the guidelines as they're set forth, which 17 are the two prior convictions. He has a record that 18 includes more than two prior convictions. 19 career offender -- special career offender provision, 20 that complete record would result in something -- a 21 different assessment. 22 There's no doubt that the criminal career, 23 criminal history, is an important factor here. It's a 24 factor recognized in the guidelines. 3553(a), the first 25 factor includes the history and characteristics of the 4 1 defendant. The history is persistent criminal 2 behavior. The characteristics include the entire social 3 history, which includes the family picture as presented 4 and the drug abuse, as well as the criminal episodes. 5 This offense of conviction, or these offenses 6 of conviction, are serious offenses as the government 7 has pointed out and merits serious punishment. 8 is, I think, room for considerable debate about the 9 deterrence effect of sentences, and particularly of 10 any -- a sentence of any particular length, both as a

matter of general deterrence -- perhaps as a matter of

in this -- well, in some circumstances probably a

specific deterrence, although I think that it's probably

greater specific deterrence effect from a large sentence

11

12

1314

Page 3

 $scol\ a\ transcript\ from\ shelly.\ txt \\ than\ there\ may\ be\ a\ general\ deterrence\ effect\ from\ that.$ 15 Weighing all the considerations, I think that 16 17 the quidelines recommendation is a sentence that is too 18 high for these circumstances. Because although it would 19 not be appropriate under the guidelines to take account 20 of the drug abuse, the persistent, virtually lifelong 21 drug abuse, I do think it is appropriate in assessing 22 the statutory factors, particularly in light, as the 23 defense argues, of the requirement, and I read it as a 24 requirement, that the sentence be sufficient but not 25 greater than necessary to achieve the objectives of the 1 statute. So I think under these circumstances a 2 sentence of 120 months is an appropriate sentence. 3 I would say that I gave some consideration to 4 the possibility that it would not be a minimum that 5 would control, and I gave some thought to whether the 6 sentence ought to be similar to the sentence imposed on 7 Mr. Nivar because the behavior was almost matched, 8 parallel behavior. The significant difference, though, 9 is I think that Mr. Nivar does not have the criminal history this defendant has and, therefore, this 10 11 defendant merits a higher sentence than Mr. Nivar would 12 on that reason. So I -- for what it's worth, if it ever 13 14 becomes relevant, were I free to go below 120 months, I 15 would not. I think that represents, I did a quick 16 calculation, slightly less than a 40 percent increase 17 over Mr. Nivar's; and I think that's appropriate to recognize the difference in criminal history. 18

5

Page 4

So, Mr. Scola, Thomas Scola, on your

20	conviction of these offenses and pursuant to the
21	Sentencing Reform Act of 1984, it is the judgment of the
22	Court that you be and you hereby are committed to the
23	custody of the Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a
24	term of 120 months. This consists of equal terms of 120
25	months on all of the counts of each of the counts of
1	conviction, all to be run concurrently. I will make a
2	recommendation in the judgment that you be considered
3	for participation in the 500-hour comprehensive drug
4	treatment program. Upon your release from imprisonment,
5	you shall be placed on supervised release for a term of
6	eight years.
7	PROBATION OFFICER: Six.
8	THE COURT: Six years, adjusted for the
9	
	-
10	counts of conviction, all to run concurrently. Within
11	72 hours of your release from the custody of the Bureau
12	of Prisons, you shall report in person to the district
13	to which you've been released. While you're on
14	supervised release, you shall not commit any other
15	federal, state, or local crime. You shall refrain from
16	the unlawful use or possession of any controlled
17	substance. You shall submit to a drug test within 15
18	days of your release from imprisonment and at least two
19	periodic drug tests thereafter, not to exceed a total of
20	104 in any given calendar year, all as may be directed
21	by your probation officer. You shall submit to the
22	collection of a DNA sample as directed by the probation
23	office.
24	While you're on supervised release, you shall

scola transcript from shelly.txt observe all the standard conditions that pertain to the

7

- 1 status as they are set forth in the sentencing
- 2 guidelines at Section 5D1.3(c). Those conditions are
- 3 incorporated by reference and will be set forth in the
- 4 judgment.

25

- 5 You are prohibited from possessing a firearm,
- 6 destructive device, or other dangerous weapon. You are
- 7 to participate in a program for substance abuse
- 8 treatment or counseling as may be directed by the
- 9 probation office, which may also include drug testing,
- 10 random drug testing, again not to exceed 104 tests in
- 11 any given year. You may be required to contribute to
- 12 the cost of such program based on your ability to pay or
- 13 the availability of third-party payment. You also may
- 14 be required to participate in any mental health program
- or treatment as directed by the probation office and,
- again, may be required to contribute to the cost of such
- 17 program based on your ability to pay or the availability
- 18 of third-party payment.
- 19 I will not impose a monetary fine in view of
- the financial circumstances of the defendant, but there
- is a mandatory assessment of \$100 on each of the 14
- counts of conviction, which totals \$1,400, which shall
- 23 be due forthwith.
- MS. BASSIL: I'd ask you to lift that amount
- 25 forthwith, your Honor, since he'll be incarcerated ten

- 1 years.
- 2 THE COURT: What's the custom in --
- 3 PROBATION OFFICER: BOP, I believe, will try Page 6

scola transcript from shelly.txt to take it out once he gets in there. THE COURT: At what rate? Do you know? PROBATION OFFICER: I'm not sure what rate. THE COURT: Do they deplete his account entirely or do they take --PROBATION OFFICER: No, no. THE COURT: -- some portion? PROBATION OFFICER: They'll take it out in stages. THE COURT: They can do that then. * * * * *